

MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

February 9, 2012
Maricopa Association of Governments; Ironwood Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*ADOT: Mike Normand
Avondale: Kristen Sexton for Rogene Hill
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez
Chandler: Dan Cook for RJ Zeder
*El Mirage: Lance Calvert
#Gilbert: Ken Maruyama
Glendale: Cathy Colbath, Chair
Goodyear: Cato Esquivel
Maricopa County: Mitch Wagner
Mesa: Jeff Martin for Mike James
*Paradise Valley: William Mead

Peoria: Maher Hazine
Phoenix: Neal Young
#Queen Creek: Tom Condit
Scottsdale: Madeline Clemann
Surprise: David Kohlbeck
Tempe: Robert Yabes for Jyme Sue McLaren
*Tolleson: Chris Hagen
Valley Metro Rail: Wulf Grote
*Youngtown: Grant Anderson
Regional Public Transportation Authority:
Carol Ketcherside

*Members neither present nor represented by proxy. + - Attended by Videoconference
- Attended by Audioconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Eileen Yazzie, MAG
Alice Chen, MAG
Teri Kennedy, MAG
Marc Pearsall, MAG
Steve Tate, MAG
Terry Johnson, Glendale
Christine McMurdy, Goodyear

Bob Antila, Phoenix
Jorie Bresnahan, Phoenix
Ken Kessler, Phoenix
Kini Knudson, Phoenix
Tom Remes, Phoenix
Janeen K. Gaskins, Surprise
Karen Savage, Surprise
Ben Limmer, METRO

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:06 a.m. by Chair Cathy Colbath. Chair Colbath welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that the following members were joining the meeting by teleconference, Ms. Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, Mr. Ken Maruyama of Gilbert, and Mr. Tom Condit of Queen Creek. Chair Colbath asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft January 12, 2012 Minutes

Chair Colbath asked if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft January 12, 2012 meeting minutes. Hearing no comments or corrections to the meeting minutes, Chair Colbath called for a motion to approve the draft meeting minutes. Mr. Maher Hazine of Peoria moved to approve the motion. Mr. Robert Yabes of Tempe seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Colbath stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Program Manager's Report

Chair Colbath introduced Ms. Eileen Yazzie of MAG who presented her Transit Program Manager's Report.

Ms. Yazzie began her report by noting that she would defer a majority of her comments to Agenda Item #6. She also invited Mr. Cato Esquivel to brief the committee members on an exciting new project that the City of Goodyear had engaged in. He explained that the City of Goodyear had recently received approval from the Federal government to move ahead with usage of an electronic billboard that was located at their park and ride. He added that what was unique about the project was that it allowed for advertising which generated a dedicated revenue stream for transit operations, capital and maintenance for the city. He further noted that the city was looking at this display sign as a substantial amount of revenue per year in order to allow the city to expand its transit profile and service. Chair Colbath replied that the project was great news.

Chair Colbath thanked Mr. Esquivel and Ms. Yazzie for their reports and updates and asked if there were any questions or comments. Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Colbath proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

5. *MAG Committee Operating Policies and Procedures

Chair Colbath noted that this consent item was on the agenda for information only. She noted that on January 25, 2012, the MAG Regional Council approved updating the MAG Committee Operating Policies and Procedures, Section 5.05 - Terms of Officers, to two-year terms for the technical and other policy committees. As a result of this action, the Transit Committee officers that were appointed in January 2012 will serve until December 31, 2013. She asked if there were any questions or comments. Hearing none, Chair Colbath proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. Additional FFY2012 CMAQ Funds Available to Transit Projects

Chair Colbath introduced Ms. Yazzie to present an update on additional FFY2012 CMAQ Funds Available to Transit Projects.

Ms. Yazzie noted that the item was on the agenda for information and discussion, so there was no need for action at the time. She added that this item did not need to be rushed as there were a few months of review prior to the need for action, and then referred the members to the handouts at their places. She noted that there was a memorandum regarding the Transportation Review Committee and the Management Committee both recently recommended a closeout scenario for FY2012. On February 1, 2012, the TRC recommended to approve Scenario #4: fund projects that will obligate in FFY2012 at a 50% increase of the federal share, up to 100% of project costs, with an additional \$293,000 of federal fund to CHN12-805, and the remaining balance is flexed to transit, with projects and priorities developed at a later time. At the time of the recommendation, the amount to be flexed to transit was \$22,395,731 in federal Congestion Mitigation Air Quality (CMAQ) funds. The amount may fluctuate depending on the final amount of federal CMAQ funds that were apportioned to the MAG region and if projects do not obligate. MAG should know the final amount by June/July 2012. She added that the committee had until about mid-August to flex the funds to transit.

She referred to the attached to the memorandum and a CMAQ Fact Sheet that outlined eligible and non-eligible items. The Transit Committee was requested to begin discussion on how to program/prioritize the \$22.4 million of CMAQ funds for FFY2012. She noted that preventive maintenance was not permitted with CMAQ. However, there were three projects that may use CMAQ funds, which included bus replacements and the Mesa Light Rail Extension Project. There were \$34 million of 5307 funds programmed to replace buses in 2012. If CMAQ were to fund a portion or all of the bus replacements, the 5307 funds could be used to fund preventive maintenance, which helped offset operating budgets. The Mesa Light Rail Extension project had commitments from the federal government for funding. Additional CMAQ funds could be used. She completed her presentation and invited any questions or comments from the members. Extensive discussion followed. Mr. Martin asked if the door was still open to consider utilizing additional funds on the Mesa light rail extension. Ms. Yazzie reaffirmed that it was still an option.

Ms. Yazzie responded to all of the questions, comments and input from the Committee and summarized her followup in preparation for returning back to the Transit Committee in March.

She noted that she and the Transit Operators Working Group would research the following tasks: 1.) Review the capacity of operator's preventive maintenance budgets; 2.) Research modifying the preventive maintenance distribution methodology to be adjusted to 100% for vehicle revenue miles; 3.) Clarify perimeters of using preventive maintenance within certain years; and 4.) Spending additional capital funds on rail.

Chair Colbath again thanked Ms. Yazzie for her presentation. Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Colbath proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

7. FY2012 Discretionary Grants Update

Chair Colbath introduced Ms. Alice Chen of MAG to brief the committee on an update regarding FY2012 Federal Transit Discretionary Grants.

Ms. Chen began her presentation by referring to a complimentary quote from FTA Administrator Paul Page, who stated that he believed that the City of Phoenix was the most exceptional agency when it came to mastering State of Good Repair, Clean Fuels and TIGGER applications and grants. She followed with the FTA's opinion that the region had been doing a good job in many areas, but that the grantees were lacking in the inclusion of documents such as letters of support, financial information, background, etc. She also noted that at the previous MAG meeting, a request was made to compile a summary of sample projects that had been awarded nationally for livability and state of good repair. She referred the members to the PowerPoint and to their packets. Discussion followed.

She stated that on January 25, 2012, the MAG hosted a workshop attended by transit operators in the region as well as some transit committee members to discuss potential project submissions (Attachment 7b). MAG proposed a submittal process for 2012 that was similar to the one utilized in 2011. Agencies interested in participating were required to provide the following documentation to MAG by the dates outline above: Completed application including project cost estimate; Documentation of local match (CIP, budget, letter of commitment); Support letter from city manager's office; NEPA documents if necessary; Fleet information if necessary. She added that MAG staff would work in collaboration with City of Phoenix and RPTA staff to prepare the applications; as all eligible projects with associated documentation would be recommended to MAG Regional Council for approval and submitted to FTA for consideration of funding.

Ms. Chen then referred the members to her presentation, where she reviewed the 2010 Results. She noted that the date of the first discretionary Notice of Funding Availability (NOFA) was Dec 2009, and that the time between the NOFA and submittal deadline was 6 weeks. She added that the total number of grants submitted by region was eleven, with a total requested funding value of \$109.8 Million. The total award to the region was \$9.0 Million, a percentage of 8.2%. She then referred to the 2011 Results, and that the date of the first discretionary NOFA was June 2011. The time duration between the NOFA and submittal deadline was 4-8 weeks. The number of grants submitted by the MAG region was five, with a total requested funding value of \$135.4 Million. The award for the region was \$10.4 Million, and percentage of 7.7%.

She said that the applications needed to be returned to MAG two weeks prior to the federal deadline. The submittal deadline did not allow enough time for the March 8, 2012 transit committee to make final recommendations and acquire approval by MAG Regional Council under the task force scenario. She added that a coordination meeting between MAG and Phoenix and member agencies would allow for clarification so that all collaborative efforts may be submitted simultaneously to the FTA. These efforts would only include projects that are deemed to be most consistent with FTA's funding principles and using guidelines from nationally awarded 2011 projects (Attachments 7c & d); As stated above: form a task force consisting of 9 members: City of Phoenix, RPTA, METRO, MAG staff (2), 2 bike-pedestrian, 2 transit committee (1 east valley, 1 west valley each). The intent would be to identify: Criteria for project selection; Projects that best fit with FTAs guidance, utilizing nationally awarded projects as benchmarks; Projects that have regional significance or are in the regional plan. Only projects that were recommended by the task force would be recommended to MAG Regional Council for approval and be submitted to FTA for consideration of funding.

Ms. Chen also clarified that the submitted proposals would need the following required elements: 1.) Documentation of local match (CIP, budget, letter of commitment); 2.) Support letter from city manager's office; 3.) Completed application including project cost estimate; 4.) NEPA documents if necessary; 5.) Fleet information if necessary. The submittals were due to MAG 2 weeks before federal submittal deadline – 10AM no exceptions. Ms. Chen concluded her presentation and added that she would entertain any comments or questions. A lengthy discussion by the committee at large followed and it was agreed that a special meeting would be called for in the coming days in order to move forward with the Discretionary Grant application process.

Chair Colbath thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Colbath proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. Quarterly Status Report on Federal Grant Activity

Chair Colbath introduced Mr. Ken Kessler of the City of Phoenix Transit Department and noted that he was present to answer committee questions for the Quarterly Status Report on Federal Grant Activity for February 2012. She asked if there were any questions or comments on the agenda item. Hearing no further comments or questions, Chair Colbath thanked Mr. Kessler and proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Colbath asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues that they would like added as future agenda items.

Chair Colbath inquired as to the possibility at a future meeting, of obtaining a comprehensive listing of all of the current and planned, local and regional transit studies in the MAG Region. MAG staff acknowledged that a summary would be forthcoming at the March meeting.

Chair Colbath thanked the Committee and asked if there were any further questions or comments. Hearing no further comments, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

10. Next Meeting Date

Chair Colbath thanked those present for attending the MAG Transit Committee meeting and she announced that the next meeting of the MAG Transit Committee would be held on Thursday, March 8, 2012, at 10:00 a.m. in the MAG Office, Saguaro Room. There being no further business, Chair Colbath adjourned the meeting at 11:07 a.m.